

# **Duvet Woman versus Action Man: The gendered aetiology of Chronic Fatigue Syndrome according to English newspapers**

Rebecca Murray

School of Human and Health Sciences, University of Huddersfield, Huddersfield, UK

Katy Day

School of Social Sciences, Leeds Beckett University, Leeds, UK

Jane Tobbell\*

School of Human and Health Sciences, University of Huddersfield, Huddersfield, UK

\* Corresponding author

## **ABSTRACT**

Media portrayals of conditions such as Chronic Fatigue Syndrome/Myalgic Encephalomyelitis (CFS/ME) demand exploration as the media is a potent source of information and meaning, and as such has the potential to inform public and professional understandings. To date, there is little systematic exploration of print media representations of CFS/ME. In this study, we address that gap by exploring the voices of CFS/ME sufferers in the English print media (1998-2015) from a constructionist feminist perspective. We found that portrayals of CFS/ME differ meaningfully, depending on gender. The psychological and emotional tended to be foregrounded where women were concerned and the scepticism surrounding CFS/ME as a 'non disease' was much more evident. On some occasions this was dealt

## **KEYWORDS**

CFS/ME; print media;

## **Introduction**

Chronic Fatigue Syndrome/Myalgic Encephalomyelitis (CFS/ME) is a particularly contentious condition which has been scrutinised by the media throughout the iterations of the illness. Such media scrutiny has served to construct CFS/ME in particular ways which has contributed to negative stereotypes surrounding those who suffer from the illness, particularly women. The media construction of CFS/ME is exacerbated by an elusive aetiology. Thus psychiatric and psychosocial explanations are foregrounded which encourages medical practitioners and the public alike to engage in speculation that it is ‘all in the head’ of the sufferer (Peter Conrad and Kristen Barker 2010). We do not wish here to deny the legitimacy or severity of the psychological distress associated with CFS/ME or indeed with any other illness and as such we acknowledge the legitimate relationship between mental health issues and physical symptomology. However, as most of those diagnosed with the illness are women it is widely regarded as a ‘woman’s illness’ (Judith Richman, Joseph Flaherty, and Kathleen Rospenda 1994) which means understandings and reactions to CFS/ME echo the history of hysteria and the delegitimisation of women’s pain and suffering. We argue that this representation of the illness denies it medical legitimacy and concomitant research funding. Given the negative media portrayal and wider societal mistrust of female sufferers, it is surprising that to date, constructions of CFS/ME have largely escaped critical, feminist scrutiny, especially given arguments that a sustained critique of contemporary medical and psychiatric discourse and practices are an important part of emancipatory political projects (Davi Johnson Thornton 2010). Therefore, this research explores the relationship between media portrayals of CFS/ME (through the lens of the English print media) and the implicit and explicit gendered constructions of the illness in an attempt to understand the public and professional responses to CFS/ME which contribute to the burden of CFS/ME for women.

## **The “Hysteric”: Understanding Chronic Fatigue Syndrome/Myalgic Encephalomyelitis (CFS/ME) Through Constructions of Femininity and Illness**

There is a long and dispiriting history of constructions of women’s illness which position sufferers as ‘hysterics’ (Elaine Showalter 1997; Jane Ussher 2013). The dismissal of women’s complaints as hysteria is clear in the histories of numerous medical conditions. For example, Joanna Kempner (2014) discusses medics’ dismissal of women reporting migraines as hysterical, attention seekers until neurological evidence was established. This is mirrored in the history of Multiple Sclerosis (MS) with which more women are diagnosed than men. Initially there was an absence of biomarkers and the illness was perceived as a female psychiatric condition (Keren Skegg, Paul A. Corwin and David C.G. Skegg 1988) and not a genuine illness. Kempner (2014) maintains that the word of the female sufferer is insufficient to establish such conditions as legitimate medical ones.

Thus, Linda Brannon (2005) points out that physicians are more likely to dismiss the physical complaints of women and favour emotional explanations of physical symptoms than they are for men. This is not a recent phenomenon; feminists such as Phyllis Chesler argue that women are more likely than men to be diagnosed with a psychological disorder (e.g. Phyllis Chesler 1972), for example, according to the WHO (2012), women are more likely to be diagnosed with depression than men, even when they present with identical symptoms and obtain similar scores on standardised measures of depression. One explanation for this gender disparity is that this reflects (at least in part) biases that operate in the medical and ‘psy’ professions which are informed or underpinned by dominant social constructions of gender (e.g. Joan Busfield 1996).

We argue that contemporary constructions of CFS/ME emerge from historical gendered understandings as the history of women’s illness presents diagnoses such as neurasthenia,

hysteria conversion, histrionic features, and the histrionic personality, which can all be regarded as previous incarnations of what is now known as Chronic Fatigue Syndrome (Susan Abbey and Paul Garfinkel 1991; Skegg, Corwin, and Skegg 1988). CFS/ME is estimated to have a prevalence of 0.2-0.4% in the UK (Carolyn Chew-Graham, Christopher Dowrick, Alison Wearden, Victoria Richardson, and Sarah Peters 2010). It is described as a chronic condition defined by profound and disabling incapacity due to overwhelming and persistent fatigue in addition to a wealth of complex and varied symptoms (Keiji Fukuda, Stephen Strauss, Ian Hiekie, Michael Sharpe, James Dobbins, and Anthony Komaroff 1994) with an attendant reduction in the sufferer's quality of life (Jochen Hardt, Debra Buchwald, David Wilks, Michael Sharpe, Wilfried A. Nix, and Ulrich Tiber Egle 2001).

CFS/ME is increasingly (albeit slowly) being accepted as a chronic medical condition but the aetiology remains elusive and its characterisation as a physical illness is contentious (Simon Horton, Fiona Poland, Swati Kale, Maria de Lourdes Drachler, Jose Carlos de Carvalho Leite, Maggie McArthur, and Peter Champion 2010). There are no consistent research findings to explain the condition and this has led according to Conrad and Barker (2010) to accusations of the illness being 'all in the head' of the sufferer. A central, recurring narrative within accounts of CFS/ME is a 'search for legitimacy' (Mary Horton-Salway 2001) and research has speculated that the absence of this (both public and professional) is exacerbated by beliefs that the illness predominantly afflicts women (Judith Richman, Joseph Flaherty, and Kathleen Rospenda 1994). Indeed, this is embodied in a previous incarnation when it was called 'Florence Nightingale Disease' – a high profile historical female figure who is believed to have fallen ill with the condition in 1896 after returning from the Crimean War (Leonard A. Jason, Cordelia Holbert, Susan Torres-Harding, and Renee R. Taylor 2004).

Consequently, CFS/ME has been positioned as a psychiatric illness by the predominantly male dominated realm of medicine (Jean A. Hamilton, 1994; Lisa Cosgrove,

Melissa Pearrow, and Maria McKivergan 2008; Sally Swarts 2013). Treatments feature psychiatric medications and/or psychotherapeutic interventions (Richman & Jason 2001). Although it is widely accepted that there is a psychological component to CFS/MS (e.g. Wally Karnilowicz, 2011; Kaethe Weingarten 2013), research exploring the psychological component of chronic illnesses in both women and men suggests that this is ‘part of the illness experience’ as opposed to the cause. Notwithstanding criticism of the Medical Model and the gendering of women as “docile bodies” (Susan Bordo 2003: 166), the denial of a biological cause has contributed to the stigmatisation of CFS/ME. It may be that CFS/ME has inadvertently been abandoned in the ‘psychiatric wilderness’ and despite the number of sufferers, medical training currently fails to prepare physicians for dealing with CFS/ME. This may result in physicians drawing on alternative sources of information such as the media (Carolyn Chew-Graham, Greg Cahill, Christopher Dowrick, Alison Wearden, and Sarah Peters 2008). For example, according to those such as Ragnar Levi (2001), most people learn of medical developments from the media and this includes physicians and scientists. Further, Julie Suzumi Young (2006) discusses how physicians interacting with patients who have stigmatised illnesses such as HIV and AIDS have to deal with the myriad effects of discrimination, largely because of how such illnesses have been depicted in the press. We believe that such arguments underscore the imperative for an examination of representations of CFS/ME in these spaces as the effects of mass media may influence interactions between physicians and patients in ways that should inform knowledge transfer and training.

## **Media Discourse, Gender, Health and Illness**

The media does not merely reflect social realities but rather contributes to the construction and maintenance, as well as the alteration, of those social realities (e.g. Juaane Clarke 2004). In other words, media texts are made up of discourses “that systematically inform the objects of which they speak” (Michel Foucault 1974: 19). The media can play a positive role in raising awareness of poorly understood conditions, (Mollyann Brodie, Elizabeth Hamel, Drew Altman, Robert Blendon, and John Benson 2003; Tom Freston 2009) and act as an important reference point in the absence of personal lived experience (Jean Seaton 2003; Culley et al. 2010). However, the contemporary climate of healthism (Robert Crawford, 1980), in which it has become incumbent for individuals to be ‘fit’, ‘healthy’ and to actively manage risk (Nikolas Rose 2007), and neoliberalism, wherein state and collective responsibility is de-emphasised and the individual is located as fully responsible (e.g. for their own good health) (Christina Scharff 2015) has contributed to the stigmatisation of illnesses (Kimberly Kline 2006), particularly those such as CFS/ME that are poorly understood. Conrad and Barker (2010) note that stigmatised illnesses may result in reluctance on the part of sufferers to seek help, which is problematic when an illness such as CFS/ME engenders a need for support.

Contemporary meanings around gender intersect with those around health, illness, disease and medicine. Barbara Barnett (2006) argues that the promotion and protection of health is closely associated with femininity and the duty to care (both for self and others), which positions health as a responsibility of women. Barbara Ehrenreich and Deirdre English (2010) argue that women in particular are suggested to be at risk of illness and thus must be constantly vigilant about their health and bodies. Further, media portrayals of women and men’s health, illness and medicine are not the same (e.g. Clive Seale 2002; Juaane Nancarrow Clarke 2004; Juaane Nancarrow Clarke & Julie Robinson 1999) and Juaane Nancarrow Clarke (2004) has argued that media constructions of health, illness and disease are often gendered in ways that do a disservice to women (and sometimes men). The sexist treatment of women’s bodies and

health is a major concern of the Women's Health Movement (see Amanda Hinnant 2009) and as such, representations of CFS/ME in the media not only demand analysis for the reasons already stated, but in addition, demand the feminist gaze.

We do not suggest that people absorb such media messages uncritically. Consumers of media texts are also active interpreting agents who may resist the messages to which they are exposed, depending upon their experiences and the social contexts within which they are located (e.g. Angela McRobbie 1991). Indeed, studies have highlighted the ways in which people make sense of, decode and often reject, the messages that they encounter in the mass media (e.g. Katherine Sender and Margaret Sullivan 2008). For example, normative representations of gender are sometimes read as simplistic, fantastical and/or problematic (e.g. Ros Ballaster, Margaret Beetham, Elizabeth Frazer & Sandra Hebron 1991). Similarly, media discourses which construct CFS/ME as either a non-disease or a psychogenic disease have angered the CFS/ME community for undermining the physical experiences of those incapacitated by the condition (Hilary Johnson 1996).

Given the foregoing discussion, we were interested in media constructions of CFS/ME, and in particular, the gendered dimension of such constructions. However, we could find little systematic analysis of media representations of CFS/ME to date, which formed part of the impetus for this study. More specifically, we were interested in exploring if and how CFS/ME was construed as a 'feminine condition' and the impact of this on how it was presented (e.g. as a serious physical chronic illness or a dubious psychogenic condition); any similarities and differences in how men and women suffering from the condition were positioned; and the possible implications of the discursive constructions identified for the treatment and support offered to those presenting to health professionals with symptoms characteristic of CFS/ME. Finally, we were interested in any resistant discourse (e.g. from sufferers themselves) towards dominant constructions of CFS/ME.

## Method

The study involved an exploration of representations of CFS/ME within a particularly powerful medium: newspapers as the CFS/ME story is a story which rose to prominence in print media (Patricia de Wolfe 2009). Despite the falling circulation of print media since the rise of the internet, newspapers are still widely consumed. For example, in 2018, top newspaper titles such as *The Sun* and *The Daily Mail* had circulation figures of 1.45 million and 1.26 million respectively. Even less popular titles such as *The Observer* and *The Guardian* have a readership that numbers hundreds of thousands (166.32 and 138.08 respectively) (Statistica 2018). In addition, news reports have been highlighted by numerous gender researchers in recent years as an important site where gender categories and descriptions are reproduced, inviting readers to act on the basis of those categorisations and descriptions (e.g. Alexandra Bogren 2011). As such we focused on British national newspapers to locate the analysis within a particular socio-cultural context and concentrated on those newspaper titles with the widest circulation. So as to draw upon a range of sources, the sample included both “tabloid” and “broadsheet” newspapers. In the UK, the distinction between the two types of publication is based on a number of characteristics which include the relative size of the publications (in the past broadsheets were larger in size), but more importantly, differences in target readership and reporting content. Whilst “broadsheets” (e.g. *The Guardian*) tend to be aimed at the educated and professional middle classes, “tabloids” (e.g. *The Sun*) are aimed more at the working and lower middle classes (e.g. Katy Day, Brendan Gough, and Majella McFadden 2004). In addition, previous studies have revealed that there are important differences in terms of how health issues are covered in the two types of publication that relate to style of reporting and content (e.g. Vikki Entwistle and Micheline Hancock-Beaulieu 1992). For example, “broadsheets” tend to draw more frequently upon “scientific knowledge”, whereas “tabloids” are more likely to rely upon individual case studies, quote “lay” views and opinions and have



a more “sensationalised” style of reporting (e.g. Entwistle and Hancock-Beaulieu 1992). Based upon such findings, we considered it important to include both types of publication in the sample.

### **Article Sampling:**

We decided to sample articles that were printed between 1998 – 2015 as we found that this time-frame was particularly fertile in terms of newspaper articles that had appeared on the topic. Sampling from this time-period also allowed us to examine contemporary representations of the illness, whilst also permitting a longitudinal analysis, allowing us to consider any changes that had occurred in how the condition was represented in recent years. Searches for articles were conducted using the search terms ‘Chronic Fatigue Syndrome’ (CFS) and ‘ME’ (Myalgic Encephalomyelitis) in the search engine ‘PROQUEST: International Newsstand’. 1,238 articles were identified in the initial search. Articles which referred to CFS/ME fleetingly were discarded and those which had a strong CFS/ME focus made up the data corpus. This resulted in the following data sample: *The Daily Mail* (n = 363 results), *Times* (n = 354 results), *The Guardian* (n = 198 results), *The Independent* (n = 151 results), *The Sun* (n = 126 results), *The Observer* (n = 46 results). This data sample was too large to analyse in the first instance and so in order to render this manageable whilst ensuring that the analysis produced was meaningful, we decided to focus on articles in which the voice of the sufferer was included. However, note that we did not regard the accounts of sufferers as speaking some ‘authentic truth’ that is not accessible via an examination of newspaper reports written by those with no or little direct experience of CFS/ME; rather, we regarded their accounts as constructions mediated by wider meanings around gender, illness and so forth.

We anticipated that the voice of the sufferer would allow us to explore the extent to which more official (e.g. psychological and psychiatric) discourses around CFS/ME were

reproduced, reworked or resisted by sufferers themselves and also allowed us to identify how the subject (the sufferer) as well as the object (CFS/ME) were construed. We included the voices of both women and men who identified as suffering from the condition as although the focus of the research was on depictions of femininity and CFS/ME, as outlined previously, we believed that examining how men suffering from the condition were positioned in comparison would be illuminating. Applying these criteria resulted in 23 articles which made up the final data set: *The Daily Mail* (n = 8), *The Sun* (n = 6), *The Times* (n = 4), *The Guardian* (n = 3), *The Independent* (n = 1), *The Observer* (n = 1). In addition to meeting the inclusion criteria, the dataset was an appropriate size for a study that involved an in-depth and thorough qualitative analysis (Virginia Braun, Victoria Clarke and Debra Gray 2017).

### **Analytic approach:**

A constructionist version of Virginia Braun and Victoria Clarke's (2006) thematic analysis informed by a feminist perspective was used to analyse the articles. Thematic analysis is an analytic method which searches for patterns or themes within qualitative data. It is not a theoretically rigid method, and as such Braun and Clarke (2006) emphasise that thematic analysis is a flexible approach that can be based upon either essentialist or constructionist approaches to gender. We adopted the latter in that we do not regard media descriptions as accurate or inaccurate (or partially accurate) reflections of how women really are, but rather 'versions of the truth' that often serve or seek to subvert (or again, something in between) dominant, patriarchal constructions of gender. The analysis adhered to the six stages of thematic analysis as set out by Braun and Clarke (2006): 1) familiarisation with the data set; 2) generation of initial codes; 3) searching for themes; 4) reviewing themes; 5) defining and naming themes; and 6) producing the report. In the final stages of the analysis, each author reviewed the themes and attempted to address the following questions:

- i) In what ways is CFS/ME being constructed in the article?
- ii) What are the multiple and conflicting ways in which CFS/ME is being constructed?  
Does this shift within a single article?
- iii) How are the causes of CFS/ME being attributed?
- iv) What are the different subject positions that are being offered to sufferers and the conditions of possibility for how they can/cannot be and what they can/cannot do?  
Does this differ according to gender?
- v) Do constructions of CFS/ME and gender differ across different publications and do these change over the time frame of the study?
- vi) What conditions of possibility are being created or closed off for treatment and support?
- vii) Is there evidence of resistance on the part of sufferers towards more dominant constructions of CFS?

Each of the three researchers analysed the articles independently and constructed their own interpretations of the emergent representations of the object (CFS/ME) and subject (the sufferer) within these. The authors then met to discuss their interpretations. Commonalities were revealed which were subsequently merged and reconstructed into the themes which are presented within the final analysis below.

## **Analysis**

Some of the key codes identified during the analysis that we discuss here are:

- Vulnerability

- Dependence
- Desperation
- Lively
- Depression
- Hypochondria
- Activity
- Sport
- Career
- Therapy

These codes underpinned the formation of two key themes which represent the emergent meanings and are explored below.

### **The Dependent, Desperate and Despairing Woman: Foregrounding the Psychological and Emotional**

One of the first features of the data that became apparent during analysis was that, unsurprisingly, CFS/ME was portrayed as predominantly a ‘woman’s illness’. In the personal narratives that were examined in the study, 21 of the 23 featured women. This exceeds all estimations of the distribution of sufferers in the literature. The articles often invoked ‘stereotypical’ images of women in exaggerated form:

ME affected my whole life, my physical abilities, my cognitive abilities and my emotional stability. Some days I just didn't want to go on, I would shout at my mother ‘I'm just a freak in a wheelchair’, I could see no future for myself. It was like I had been reduced to a fragile little child that everybody had to care for. Weathers, Helen, Daily Mail [London, UK] 06 June 2000:42.

My body and mind is broken. I am so desperate to end the never-ending carousel of pain and sickness and suffering. I love my family. I have nothing left and I am spent. 'I really, really want to die. I've had enough of being in so much pain. Gilderdale, Lynn, The Times [London, UK] 26 Jan 2010:6.

I walked into my office and suddenly the noise and the crowds were too much. I couldn't cope, I could hardly move. I shuffled into a small meeting room and phoned my boss. 'The invisible disease that stole my life'. Power, Marianne Daily Mail [London, UK] 18 May 2010:25.

I would pray to God I wouldn't wake up. I would just say, 'Please, whatever this is, it is making me feel so bad, just let it kill me... The longest I went without leaving the house was a month. I didn't want to see or speak to anyone. I couldn't cope with everyday things, even feeding my dog. 'Just let it kill me. Obank, Nick The Sun [London, UK] 22nd September 2013: 4.

In the excerpts above, the women's voices are central and they are positioned as being able to speak authoritatively about their experiences (see also Hinnant 2009). Ostensibly the suffering of the women is communicated, which may potentially promote understanding, empathy and acceptance of CFS as a legitimate, debilitating condition. However, in doing so, they promulgate a particular image of the ill woman and of the illness itself. Although the excerpts do refer to physical suffering and incapacity there is a strong focus on the emotional and psychological suffering invoked by CFS and references were frequently made to 'emotional instability' (see also Clarke's 2004 analysis of media constructions of breast cancer). Women sufferers were also infantilised and positioned as vulnerable and dependent, as can be seen in the first extract above. Further, the language used and sufferers' quotes that were selected had a 'dramatic' and desperate tone. Whilst it has been noted previously that such 'sensationalised'

reporting is more characteristic of tabloid newspapers (e.g. Entwistle & Hancock-Beaulieu 1992), we detected little difference between newspapers.

These quotes appear to be examples of what Arthur Frank (1998) describes as ‘chaos’ narratives of illness experiences which are characterised by a sense of hopelessness, despair and pessimism. Frank believed that these types of narratives are less culturally sanctioned than more optimistic narratives, possibly because there is a cultural conviction in Western societies that individualised will and hope can overcome bodily processes (e.g. Rose 2007) and a failure to have hope is regarded as a failure to actively will one’s own health, a moral failing which in turn contributes to the disease itself (see Monica Greco 1993). As such, according to Frank, these narratives are relatively inaccessible and may remain unspoken. Gender appears to be instructive here, in that the gender of the storyteller is important to how ‘acceptable’ such narratives are. Social constructions of women as weaker and more emotional than men who are in control of themselves (e.g. Busfield 1996), in addition to the histrionic features which emerge from the history of CFS/ME (Skegg, Corwin, & Skegg 1988) may mean that chaos narratives lend themselves more easily to women. At the same time, the woman with CFS/ME is positioned as failing to will herself back to health; a poor neoliberal citizen.

We wish to make no attempt here to deny the legitimacy or severity of the psychological distress associated with CFS/ME and fully accept the relationship between mental health issues and physical symptomology (Abhijit Chaudhuri and Peter O. Behan 2004; Francis Creed 2009; Stephanie Leone 2010). We are cognizant of the fact that problematising the mental health label attached to CFS/ME in some ways suggests that mental suffering is less acceptable or legitimate than physical suffering, a position we strongly reject (see Philip J. Rosenbaum & Heather Liebert 2015, for a discussion of the dangers associated with ‘shutting down’ voices of psychological distress via medicalisation). However, such foregrounding may be stigmatising for women with CFS/ME as, first, it can serve to obscure their physical experience

of illness confining it to the shadow of the emotional. Second, this reifies constructions of femininity in terms of (unstable) emotionality and fragility. This may be implicitly exercised in interpersonal interactions between health professionals and sufferers and in macro policy decision making.

The impact of ‘stereotypical’ representations of CFS/ME sufferers is addressed in the excerpt below:

It says a lot about the public perception of myalgic encephalomyelitis (ME) that it is a surprise to find that Nicola Warner is lively, positive and talks a lot. That's the initial impression anyway. It's only when you spend a little time in her company that you notice a certain stillness or perhaps sadness in her face and it becomes obvious that she is not entirely well. ‘Doctors, school, friends thought I was faking it’. Wark, Penny The Times [London, UK] 25 Jan 2010: 6.

This excerpt only momentarily challenges the ‘stereotype’ before looking beneath the lively, positive and chatty Nicola to the still, sad and not entirely well Nicola, thus calling back into play the passive and emotionally unwell sufferer. Such nuanced accounts of women sufferers which appear, on the surface, to be sympathetic but can also be read as stigmatising, were notable across the dataset where accounts of suffering were often discussed alongside and embedded in the scepticism of medics:

Because Emily's recovery really started after her treatment for depression, it might be tempting for some people to presume that her condition really was all in the mind... ‘I no longer feel like a freak’. Weathers, Helen Daily Mail [London, UK] 06 June 2000: 42.

Fellow sufferers have been accused of hypochondria when, in fact, they are suffering from a genuine condition. 'I'm 'lazy' because I have ME'. Daily Mail [London, UK] 20 May 2003: 55

Many [practitioners] suggested it was 'just' depression; CFS/ME can, understandably, make you feel depressed, but it's not the depression causing the illness. Smith, Claire, Daily Mail [London, UK] 23rd July 2014: 50.

These excerpts do not read as an attack on women who have CFS/ME. However, the frequent inclusion of statements such as '*all in the mind*', '*hypochondria*', '*"just" depression*' '*wallowing in self-pity*' and '*hysterical, manipulative or psychologically bizarre*', within the boundaries of sympathy, echo the history of scepticism. Previous feminist studies of media texts have highlighted such complexity in accounting. For example, in their analysis of the coverage of women and alcohol consumption in the British national press, Day, Gough and McFadden (2004) found that the tone of articles addressing the harm that women have suffered in drinking contexts (e.g. physical assault) tended to be supportive. However, at the same time, accounts and statements were 'smuggled in' which problematized and undermined this, such as the suggestion (often implicit) that the women were at least partially responsible. The result is that the authors are able to appear sympathetic and hopefully avoid criticism, whilst also allowing for the reproduction of stereotypical images of femininity, harmful myths and the maintenance of unequal relations of power between men and women.

Other comments tackled the 'gendered nature' of CFS/ME and the lack of any identifiable physical cause 'head on':

In the Nineties, 85 per cent of patients with ME around the world are female, and despite an enormous medical research programme, no physiological or biochemical explanation of the illness has ever been



confirmed. 'Human Condition: 'I am a duvet woman: this bed is my mother, my lover, my wife'. Showalter, Elaine, *The Independent* [London, UK] 25 Jan 1998:4.

The excerpt above begins by establishing the global gendered nature of CFS/ME. Showalter then emphasises (and exaggerates) the effort that has been put into identifying a physiological cause, thus closing down any possible claim that a failure to identify such a cause is due to a lack of funded research activity. Rather, the suggestion is that a physical aetiology has not been identified because there isn't one. The implication that CFS/ME is 'all in the mind' and further, 'all in the *female* mind' whilst implicit, is transparent here. Indeed, Showalter's work on illnesses such as CFS/ME (e.g. Showalter 1997) has caused a considerable amount of controversy (see Carol Tavris 1997; Toril Moi 1985) by seemingly suggesting that this is indeed a contemporary manifestation of hysteria. We argue here that such constructions of CFS/ME are unhelpful and harmful to women who identify as having the condition.

In sum, despite some more marginal exceptions, the dominant image of the woman with CFS/ME that was presented in the articles characterised her as weak, dependent, child-like, socially-withdrawn and emotionally and psychologically distressed and unstable. Psychology and psychiatry are foregrounded in the accounts presented, thus the media spotlight on women with CFS/ME perpetuates (at least in part) the idea that this is a psychogenic disorder (Holly Angelique & Marci Culley 2000). This becomes more apparent if we examine representations of men with CFS/ME.

### **Action Man Cut Down in His Prime: Foregrounding the Physical**

In contrast to the accounts of women's experiences of CFS/ME, articles focussing on men foregrounded the physical with less focus on the emotional and psychological:

Gary recalls 'I was a member of The Mighty Eastbourne Eagles, one of the country's top speedway teams. I was racing every day and I was so fit I ran three marathons with no training'. The motorbike nut was astonished when one day he didn't have the energy to lift his head off the pillow. 'I was so fit I ran three marathons... then one day I was too weak to get out of my bed. Madell, Soraya, The Sun [London, UK] 19 Dec 2002:53.

Action man Peter Rothwell enjoyed a distinguished military career, excelled in sport and was about to take his black belt in karate when he was struck down with ME. 'I was RAF high-flyer... now I can barely get out of bed'. Bolouri, Yvonne, The Sun [London, UK] 18 May 2009: 47.

In the excerpts above, the emphasis is on incredibly physically active men being 'struck down' with CFS/ME and numerous references are made to sporting activities and occupations which require a high level of physical fitness. Studies examining media depictions of testicular cancer have similarly noted how hegemonic masculinity is brought into play in the form of references to sports, competition, money and war (see Clarke 2004). This image of the 'action man' cut down in his prime stands in stark contrast to the image of the 'duvet woman' (a term actually employed in the title of an article in our sample) whose problems are psychological. These accounts underscore that these were not just men who were physically fit, but ones that excelled in their careers and sporting achievements. CFS/ME is constructed here as a 'thunderbolt' which hit the men suddenly and from nowhere. References to the impact of CFS/ME on the sporting activities and careers of women sufferers, in contrast, were notably absent in the articles with the focus being placed more usually on how their relationships (e.g. with family members) and ability to function socially were affected, thus drawing upon long-standing notions that relationality and sociability are hallmarks of femininity (e.g. Roberta Oetzel 1966).

The accounting here appears to serve two main functions. First, the men are abdicated of any responsibility for their illness. In a media text analysis, Paul Crawshaw (2007) found that ‘good health’ and a ‘fit body’ (however defined) were presented as expressions of male control and domination and therefore men who failed to achieve these were positioned as ‘weak men’ who were ‘letting the side down’. However here, the articles were actively resisting such possible positioning by emphasising that these were by no means ‘lazy’ men; rather CFS/ME is something that happened *to them* despite being physically active and presumably leading healthy lifestyles. Second, the exaggerated masculinity on offer here could be read as resistance towards any possible emasculation of men suffering from what is often considered a ‘feminine illness’.

This resistance towards emasculation can be seen further in the ways in which men positioned themselves as immune to mental frailty:

... I was prescribed anti-depressants but I didn’t take them. I was suffering physical exhaustion, not depression. ‘I was so fit I ran three marathons... then one day I was too weak to get out of my bed. Madell, Soraya, The Sun [London, UK] 19 Dec 2002:53.

... I was given pacing therapy, where you learn to keep within your limits and conserve energy.” ‘I was RAF high-flyer... now I can barely get out of bed. Bolouri, Yvonne, The Sun [London, UK] 18 May 2009: 47.

Gary explicitly rejects the notion that he is suffering from a psychological condition. He claims ‘*physical exhaustion*’ which implies that his illness was a result of leading a lifestyle that was perhaps *too* active, thus enabling Gary to position himself as a good, healthy neoliberal citizen. Given the argument here that depression is implicitly and explicitly constructed as a female condition it appears that Gary is attempting to distance himself from feminised constructions

of psychological fragility. In the second extract, Peter describes how he was given pacing therapy which involves the sufferer scheduling periods of rest in their daily activities in order to avoid ‘overdoing things’. Notably, in cases where treatment for CFS/ME was discussed, it was usually cognitive behavioural therapy that was referred to. However, in Peter’s case, the treatment prescribed had a physical orientation. This is testament to how different (gendered) constructions of illness can have an impact upon treatment options. A more extreme example of this can be seen in the final excerpt below:

Yet, as Sophia's treatment by the medical establishment had underlined-  
she was forcibly sectioned for a spell in 2003 – many doctors handle ME  
(also known as post viral or chronic fatigue syndrome), as if it were a  
mental condition. ‘She went into a hellhole’ Anonymous Daily Mail  
[London, UK] 15 May 2010: 26.

The excerpt flags up ‘sectioning’ as one possible consequence of the medical establishment’s framing of CFS/ME as a psychological or ‘*mental*’ condition. This isn’t a gender neutral issue. Women are more likely to be diagnosed with CFS/ME than men, it is widely regarded as a ‘woman’s illness’ and, as demonstrated in the analysis presented here, CFS/ME was more likely to be construed in terms of psychological and emotional problems in the print media that we analysed where women sufferers were concerned. The forced sectioning of Sophia (whilst an extreme example) stands in stark contrast to the pacing therapy that was recommended for Peter.

## **Conclusion**

Accounts of CFS/ME were individualised, focussing on the psychological, emotional and physical impact on the sufferer. For example, there was scant discussion of any possible social, cultural or environment contributors to the condition (e.g. a culture of ‘overwork’), particularly

where women were concerned. This is a trend that has been noted in relation to other illnesses (see also Phil Brown, Stephen Zavestoski, Sabrina McCormick, Joshua Mandelbaum, and Theo Luebke 2001). This, we argue, is reflective of the contemporary neoliberal focus upon the individual and the individualisation of sickness which is amplified by the emphasis on individual modes of treatment and therapy such as CBT. Recovery or management of the condition is a personal endeavour. Further than this, as demonstrated, constructions of CFS/ME in British print media are deeply gendered. Women who were sufferers were depicted as emotionally and psychologically distressed and unstable, childlike and dependent, and emphasis was typically placed on the disruption of the illness to their relationships and social life. In contrast, men were portrayed as physically active and successful before the disease 'struck' from nowhere and the physical consequences were foregrounded rather than the emotional and psychological. Such rigid and stereotypical reporting may be alienating for women, and men, who are struggling with CFS/ME and do not identify with or want to identify with the gendered tropes on offer, thus discouraging them from seeking help. Further, these gendered depictions largely reproduce gender ideologies (e.g. April Gordon 1995) in ways that accredit the 'male experience' with greater legitimacy. The archetype of the 'hysterical woman' (Ussher 1991) provides the historical backdrop for this. Reports were largely sympathetic to women suffering from CFS/ME and nuanced (e.g. detailing extreme suffering alongside 'expert' accounts of scepticism and uncertainty), and so we do not want to present an oversimplistic account or claim malice on the part of British national press. However, we argue that implicit assumptions need to be drawn out and rendered explicit in order to challenge the sexist construing of illness and to encourage more reflection on how women's experiences are reported and represented.

The findings of the study will probably come as no great surprise to feminist scholars and activists. That said, to date, there is a lack of systematic feminist analysis of gendered,

media constructions of CFS/ME. Further, the implications of the findings are not trivial. These constructions of the hysterical woman for whom it is ‘all in the mind’ (bolstered by ‘expert knowledge’) are burdening for women who claim and/or have been diagnosed with CFS/ME. Those identifying as CFS/ME sufferers have battled for their experiences to be recognised as legitimate physical illness which such constructions do little to support. This is a burden that may not be carried by women and men equally. In addition, this may impact upon treatments considered appropriate. These may or may not be beneficial to the sufferer, but this is a recommendation and choice that should not be dictated by gender and assumptions about the causes and experience of CFS/ME.

## References

- Abbey, Susan, and Paul Garfinkel. 1991. “Neurasthenia and Chronic Fatigue Syndrome: The Role of Culture in the Making of a Diagnosis.” *American Journal of Psychotherapy* 148: 1638-1646. doi: 10.1176/ajp.148.12.1638
- Angelique, Holly, and Marci Culley. 2000. “Searching for Feminism: An Analysis of Community Psychology literature Relevant to Women’s Concerns.” *American Journal of Community Psychology* 28: 793-813. doi: 10.1016/j.pec.2011.04.016

- Ballaster, Ros, Margaret Beetham, Elizabeth Frazer, and Sandra Hebron. 1991. *Women's Worlds: Ideology, Femininity and the Woman's Magazine*. London: The Macmillan Press Ltd
- Barnett, Barbara. 2006. "Health as women's work: a pilot study on how women's magazines frame medical news and femininity." *Women and Language* 29 (2): 1–12.
- Bogren, Alexandra. 2011. "Gender and alcohol: The Swedish press debate." *Journal of Gender Studies* 20 (2): 155-169. doi: 10. 1080/09589236.2011.565196
- Bordo, Susan. 2003. *Unbearable Weight: Feminism, Western Culture, and the Body*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Brannon, Linda. 2005. *Gender: Psychological Perspectives (4<sup>th</sup> edition)*. London: Pearson.
- Braun, Virginia, and Victoria Clarke. 2006. "Using thematic analysis in psychology." *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 3: 77-101. doi: 10. 1191/1478088706qp063oa
- Braun, Virginia, Clarke Victoria and Gray, Debra. 2017. *Collecting Qualitative Data: A Practical Guide to Textual, Media and Virtual Techniques*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Brodie, Mollyann, Elizabeth Hamel, Drew Altman, Robert Blendon, and John Benson. 2003. "Health news and the American public, 1996–2002." *Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law* 28 (5): 927-950. doi: 10. 1215/03616878-28-5-927
- Brown, Phil, Stephen Zavestoski, Sabrina McCormick, Joshua Mandelbaum, and Theo Luebke. 2001. "Print media coverage of environmental causation of breast cancer." *Sociology of Health & Illness* 23 (6): 747-775. doi: 10. 1111/1467-9566.00274

- Busfield, Joan. 1996. *Men, women and madness: Understanding gender and mental disorder*. NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Chaudhuri, Abhijit & Behan, Peter O. 2004. "Fatigue in Neurological disorders." *The Lancet* 363 (9413): 978-988. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(04)15794-2.
- Chesler, Phyllis. 1972. *Women and madness*. Garden City, NY: Doubleday.
- Chew-Graham, Carolyn, Greg Cahill, Christopher Dowrick, Alison Wearden, and Sarah Peters. 2008. "Using Multiple Sources of Knowledge to Reach Clinical Understanding of Chronic Fatigue Syndrome." *Annals of family Medicine* 6 (4): 340-348. doi: 10. 1370/afm.867
- Chew-Graham, Carolyn, Christopher Dowrick, Alison Wearden, Victoria Richardson, and Sarah Peters. 2010. "Making the Diagnosis of CFS/ME in Primary Care: A Qualitative Study." *BMC Family Practice* 11 (1): 16-23. Doi: 10.1186/1471-2296-11-16
- Clarke, Juane Nancarrow. 2004. "A comparison of breast, testicular and prostate cancer in mass print media (1996–2001)." *Social Science & Medicine* 59 (3): 541-551. doi: 10.1016/j.socscimed.2003.11.018
- Clarke, Juane Nancarrow & Robinson, Julie. 1999. "Testicular cancer: Medicine and machismo in the media (1980-1984)." *Health* 3 (3): 263-282.
- Conrad, Peter, and Kristen Barker. 2010. "The Social Construction of Illness – Key Insights and Policy Implications." *Journal of Health and Social Behaviour* 51 (5): S67-S79. doi: 10. 1177/0022146510383495



- Cosgrove, Lisa, Melissa Pearrow, and Maria McKivergan. 2008. "Toward a new paradigm for psychiatric diagnoses and clinical research in sexology." *Feminism & Psychology* 18 (4): 457-465. doi: 10.1177/0959353508095528
- Crawford, Robert. 1980. "Healthism and the medicalization of everyday life." *International journal of health services* 10 (3): 365-388. doi: 10.2190/3H2H-SXJN-3KAY-GPNY
- Crawshaw, Paul. 2007. "Governing the healthy male citizen: Men, masculinity and popular health in Men's Health magazine." *Social Science & Medicine* 65 (8): 1606-1618. doi: 10.1016/j.socscimed.2007.05.026
- Creed, Francis. 2009. "Medically unexplained symptoms – blurring the line between “mental” and “physical” in somatoform disorders." *Journal of Psychosomatic Research* 67 (3): 185- 187. doi: 10.1016/j.jpsychores.2009.07.001
- Culley, Marci, Emma Ogleby-Oliver, Adam Carton, and Jalika Street. (2010). "Media Framing of Proposed Nuclear Reactors: An Analysis of Print Media." *Journal of Community & Applied Social Psychology*, 20 (6): 497-512. doi: 10.1002/casp.1056
- Day, Katy, Brendan Gough, and Majella McFadden. 2004. ""“WARNING! ALCOHOL CAN SERIOUSLY DAMAGE YOUR FEMININE HEALTH” A discourse analysis of recent British newspaper coverage of women and drinking." *Feminist Media Studies* 4 (2): 165-183. doi: 10.1080/1468077042000251238
- Ehrenreich, Barbara, and Deirdre English. 2010. *Witches, midwives, and nurses: A history of women healers*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn. NY: Feminist Press at the City University of New York.
- Entwistle, Vikki, and Micheline Hancock-Beaulieu. 1992. "Health and medical coverage in the UK national press." *Public Understanding of Science* 1 (4): 367-382. doi: 10.1088/0963-6625/1/4/002

- Foucault, Michel. 1974. *Abnormal: Lectures at the College de France, 1975, 137-166* (*Lectures at the College de France*), edited by Valerio Marchetti & Antonella Salamoni. London: Verso
- Frank, Arthur. 1998. "Just listening: Narrative and deep illness." *Families Systems and Health* 16: 197-212. doi: 10. 1037/h0089849
- Freston, Tom. 2009. "Media and the HIV fight." *Brandweek*, 50 (43), 13. Accessed November 12, 2016.  
<http://rc4ht3qs8p.search.serialssolutions.com.libaccess.hud.ac.uk/>
- Fukuda, Keiji, Stephen Strauss, Ian Hickie, Michael Sharpe, James Dobbins, and Anthony Komaroff. 1994. "The Chronic Fatigue Syndrome: A comprehensive approach to its definition and study." *Annals of Internal Medicine* 121 (12): 953-959. doi: 10. 1059/0003-4819-121-12-199412150-00009
- Gordon, April. 1995. "Gender, ethnicity, and class in Kenya:" Burying Otieno" revisited." *Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 20 (4): 883-912. doi: 10. 1086/495025
- Greco, Monica. 1993. "Psychosomatic subjects and the 'duty to be well'. Personal agency within." *Economy and society* 22 (3): 357-372. doi: 10. 1080/030851493000000024
- Hamilton, Jean A. Feminist theory and health psychology: Tools for an egalitarian, women-centred approach to women's health. In Dan, A. (ed). *Reframing women's health: Multidisciplinary research and practice*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 1994.
- Hardt, Jochen, Buchwald, Debra, Wilks, David, Sharpe, Michael, Nix, Wilfried A. & Egle, Ulrich Tiber. 2001. "Health related quality of life in patients with Chronic Fatigue Syndrome: An international study". *Journal of Psychosomatic Research* 51(2): 431-434. doi: 10.1016/S0022-3999(01)00220-3.

- Hinnant, Amanda. 2009. "The cancer on your coffee table: A discourse analysis of the health content in mass-circulated women's magazines." *Feminist Media Studies* 9 (3): 317-333. doi: 10.1080/14680770903068282
- Horton, Simon, Fiona Poland, Swati Kale, Maria de Lourdes Drachler, Jose Carlos de Carvalho Leite, Maggie McArthur, Peter Champion. 2010. "Chronic fatigue syndrome/myalgic encephalomyelitis (CFS/ME) in adults: a qualitative study of perspectives from professional practice." *BMC Family Practice* 11 (1): 89-102. doi: 10.1186/1471-2296-11-18
- Horton-Salway, Mary. 2001. "Narrative identities and the management of personal accountability in talk about ME: A discursive approach to illness narrative." *Journal of Health Psychology* 6 (2): 247-259. doi: 10.1177/135910530100600210
- Jason, Leonard A., Holbert, Cordelia, Susan Torres-Harding, & Renee R. Taylor, R. 2004. "Stigma and the term Chronic Fatigue Syndrome: Results of surveys on changing the name". *Journal of Disability Policy Studies*, 14 (4): 222-228. doi: 10.1177/10442073040140040401.
- Johnson Thornton, Davi. 2010. "Race, risk and pathology in psychiatric culture: Disease awareness campaigns as governmental rhetoric." *Critical Studies in Media Communication* 27 (4): 311-335. doi: 10.1080/15295030903583598
- Johnson, Hilary. 1996. *Osler's web: Inside the labyrinth of the Chronic Fatigue Syndrome epidemic*. Lincoln, USA: iUniverse, Inc.
- Karnilowicz, Wally. 2011. "Identity and psychological ownership in chronic illness and disease state." *European Journal of Cancer Care* 20 (2): 276-282. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2354.2010.01220.x

- Kempner, Joanna. 2014. *Not Tonight – Migraine and the Politics of Gender and Health*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Kline, Kimberly. 2006. “A decade of research on health content in the media: the focus on health challenges and sociocultural context and attendant informational and ideological problems.” *Journal of Health Communication* 11 (1): 43-59. doi: 10.1080/10810730500461067
- Leone, Stephanie. 2010. “A disabling combination: Fatigue and depression.” *British Journal of Psychiatry* 197 (2): 86-87. doi: 10.1192/bjp.bp/109.076604
- Levi, Ragnar. 2001. *Medical Journalism: Exposing Fact, Fiction, Fraud*. Iowa State University Press, Ames.
- McRobbie, Angela. 1991. *Settling accounts with subculture: A feminist critique*. In *Feminism and youth culture* (pp. 16-34). Macmillan Education UK.
- Moi, Toril. 1985. *Sexual/Textual Politics*. London: Routledge.
- Oetzel, Roberta. 1966. “Annotated bibliography.” In *The Development of Sex Differences*, edited by Eleanor, E. Maccoby, 223-323. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Richman, Judith, and Jason Leonard A. 2001. “Gender biases underlying the social construction of Chronic Fatigue Syndrome.” *Current Sociology* 49 (3): 15-29. doi: 10.1177/0011392101049003003
- Richman, Judith, Joseph Flaherty, and Kathleen Rospenda. 1994. “Chronic fatigue syndrome: Have flawed assumptions been derived from treatment based studies?” *American Journal of Public Health* 84: 282-284. doi: 10.2105/AJPH.84.2.282
- Rose, Nikolas. 2007. *The Politics of Life Itself*. Princeton NJ: Princeton University Press.

- Rosenbaum, Philip, J. & Liebert, Heather. 2015. "Reframing the conversation on college student mental health." *Journal of College Student Psychotherapy* 29 (3): 179-196. doi: 10.1080/87568225.2015.1045780.
- Scharff, Christina. 2015. "The psychic life of neoliberalism." *Theory, Culture and Society* 33 (6): 107-122. doi: 10.1177/0263276415590164
- Seale, Clive. 2002. "Cancer heroics: a study of news reports with particular reference to gender." *Sociology* 36 (1): 107-126. doi: 10.1177/0038038502036001006
- Seaton, Jean. 2003. "The sociology of the mass media". In *Power Without Responsibility: Press, Broadcasting, and New Media in Britain* by James Curran & Jean Seaton, 317-340. London: Routledge.
- Sender, Katherine, & Margaret Sullivan. 2008. "Epidemics of will, failures of self-esteem: Responding to fat bodies in *The Biggest Loser* and *What Not to Wear*." *Journal of Media & Cultural Studies* 22 (4): 573-584. doi: 10.1080/10304310802190046
- Showalter, Elaine. 1997. *Hystories: Hysterical Epidemics and Modern Culture*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Skegg, Keren, & Paul, A. Corwin & David C.G. Skegg, 1988. "How often is multiple sclerosis mistaken for psychiatric disorder?" *Psychological Medicine* 18(3): 733-736. Doi: 10.1017/S0033291700008436
- Swartz, Sally. 2013. "Feminism and psychiatric diagnosis: Reflections of a feminist practitioner." *Feminism and Psychology* 23: 41-48.
- Statista 2018. Circulation of newspapers in the United Kingdom (UK) as of June 2018. Accessed August 28, 2018. <https://www.statista.com/statistics/529060/uk-newspaper-market-by-circulation/>.

Tavris, Carol. 1997. "Pursued by Fashionable Furies." Accessed May 12, 2014.

<https://archivenytimes.com/www.nytimes.com/books/97/05/04/reviews/970504.04>

Ussher, Jane. 1999. *Women's madness: Misogyny or mental illness?* Amherst, MA, US: University of Massachusetts Press.

Ussher, Jane. 2013. "Diagnosing Difficult Women and Pathologising Femininity: Gender Bias in Psychiatric Nosology." *Feminism & Psychology* 23 (1): 63-69. doi: 10.1177/0959353512467968

de Wolfe, Patricia. 2009. "ME: The rise and fall of a media sensation." Accessed Jan 24, 2017. <http://www.medicalsociologyonline.org/resources/MSo-&-MSN-Archive/MSoVol4Issue1.pdf#page=5>

Weingarten, Kaethe. 2013. "The "cruel radiance of what is": Helping couples live with chronic illness." *Family Process* 52: 83-101. doi: 10.1111/famp.12017

WHO 2012. Social Determinants of Health: Health Systems. Accessed November 13<sup>th</sup>, 2016. [http://www.who.int/social\\_determinants/en/](http://www.who.int/social_determinants/en/)

Young, Julie Suzumi. 2002. "Mass Media and Medicine: Challenges and Opportunities." *MSJAMA* 287 (6): 772. doi: 10.1001/jama.287.6.772-JMS0213-2-1

